Subject: Diff in Diff OLS Estimation and Interpretation Posted by Goethe2014 on Thu, 28 May 2020 16:21:33 GMT View Forum Message <> Reply to Message

Dear all,

Currently I am running a OLS Difference and Difference regression on Nigerian DHS data (2008 and 2018) and am trying to estimate the effect of terror (Boko Haram in this case) on childmarriage and teenage childbirth/pregnancy. In this regard I also want to estimate the effect on age at childmarriage and age at teenage childbirth/pregnancy for the women who did actually face these circumstances.

My questions are: How would you judge the effects on attacknumber and attacknumber*BH in both the cases 1) age at childmarriage and 2) age at teenage childbirth. From my understanding this would mean an additional attack in a non-BH area raises the age at childmarriage by +0.06years and the age at teenage childbirth by +0.07 years. If we now look at the interaction effects we see that these are pretty much the same amount but with the opposite sign (negative) (-0.06 years/-0.07 years). I would interpret it in this way, that the overall effect of an attack on a BH affected states is essentially zero as the two coefficients cancel out (beta1+beta3=0) so the age stays the same with an increase in one attack. In non-BH states however an additional attack increases the age (beta1>0). Would this be the correct interpretation?

Another question would be: Why do my models omit the state Kaduna? One state is already omitted (Sokoto) as the baseline surveystate. Nonetheless, all my estimations omit Kaduna as well. Note: Kaduna is part of the BH coded group(surveystates: Borno, Yobe, Adamawa, Kano, Gombe, Bauchi, Kauna then BH=1). So could this be due to some colinearity etc? I checked and all observations and values for Kaduna are correctly coded as for all other states which do not seem to present this "omitted" issue.

Thank you very much in advance for any help! Greetings

Running my final model using the following commands I get these results:

svy: reg agefirstunionCM i.BH c.attacknumberCM c.attacknumberCM#i.BH i.muslim i.urban i.kanuri i.hhheadmale i.literacy i.wealthindex i.edulevel c.eduyears i.edulevelpartner c.eduyearspartner i.largefamily i.polygamoushh i.surveystate Survey: Linear regression

Number of strata	=	146	Numb	er of o	bs :	=	7,825
Number of PSUs	=	1,640	Рор	ulatior	n size	=	7,693,726,278
		Design	df	=	1,494	4	
		F(53,	1442)	=	10.6	67	
		Prob > F	= ;	=	0.000	0	
		R-squar	ed	=	0.09	35	

Linearized agefirstunionCM | Coef. Std. Err. t P>|t| [95% Conf. Interval] ------1.BH | .2678601 .1535981 1.74 0.081 -.0334307 .5691509 attacknumberCM | .0606883 .0080648 7.53 0.000 .0448688 .0765078 BH#c.attacknumberCM | 1 | -.0597985 .008065 -7.41 0.000 -.0756184 -.0439785 1.muslim | -.1875304 .1036764 -1.81 0.071 -.3908971 .0158363 1.urban | -.0253483 .067249 -0.38 0.706 -.1572608 .1065642 1.kanuri | -.093941 .1311277 -0.72 0.474 -.3511549 .163273 1.hhheadmale | -.0833878 .0745814 -1.12 0.264 -.2296831 .0629076 1.literacy | .0773257 .0785068 0.98 0.325 -.0766695 .2313209 wealthindex | poorer | .0855394 .0556279 1.54 0.124 -.0235776 .1946564 middle | .1246874 .0750185 1.66 0.097 -.0224653 .2718401 richer | .2579857 .0921339 2.80 0.005 .0772601 .4387113 richest | .302223 .1318766 2.29 0.022 .0435401 .5609059 1.edulevel | .0766587 .1100335 0.70 0.486 -.1391778 .2924952 eduyears | .0187935 .0120535 1.56 0.119 -.00485 .042437 1.edulevelpartner | -.1190187 .1186531 -1.00 0.316 -.3517631 .1137257 eduyearspartner | .0193016 .0103064 1.87 0.061 -.0009149 .0395181 1.largefamily | .0050871 .0386496 0.13 0.895 -.0707262 .0809003 1.polygamoushh | -.1149114 .0461247 -2.49 0.013 -.2053874 -.0244355 surveystate | zamfara | -.1567509 .1577283 -0.99 0.320 -.4661433 .1526415 katsina | -.058353 .1397715 -0.42 0.676 -.3325222 .2158162 jigawa | .6201046 .1272395 4.87 0.000 .3705176 .8696916 yobe | -.0515254 .1592621 -0.32 0.746 -.3639265 .2608758 borno | -.7478194 .205227 -3.64 0.000 -1.150383 -.3452558 adamawa | .2552234 .1539995 1.66 0.098 -.0468549 .5573016 gombe | .1744793 .1335148 1.31 0.191 -.0874171 .4363757 bauchi | -.0511485 .1345675 -0.38 0.704 -.3151098 .2128128 kano | -.0184404 .1325222 -0.14 0.889 -.2783897 .2415089 kaduna | 0 (omitted) kebbi | .5643663 .1536166 3.67 0.000 .2630391 .8656934 niger | .32048 .1612237 1.99 0.047 .0042311 .6367289 abuja | -.3547092 .2775083 -1.28 0.201 -.8990565 .1896382 nasarawa | .4572007 .1733962 2.64 0.008 .1170748 .7973266 plateau | -.065136 .2224453 -0.29 0.770 -.5014744 .3712023 taraba | .5864252 .1233278 4.76 0.000 .3445111 .8283393 benue | .5949883 .1740201 3.42 0.001 .2536386 .9363379 kogi | .1937181 .1784986 1.09 0.278 -.1564164 .5438526

kwara | .7585649 .2532547 3.00 0.003 .2617923 1.255338 oyo | .9811194 .1860203 5.27 0.000 .6162307 1.346008 osun | .8110708 .2348476 3.45 0.001 .3504048 1.271737 ekiti | .9938482 .2102819 4.73 0.000 .581369 1.406327 ondo | 1.057972 .2461233 4.30 0.000 .5751884 1.540756 edo | .5724927 .3749659 1.53 0.127 -.1630229 1.308008 anambra | .5366899 .2776328 1.93 0.053 -.0079017 1.081281 enugu | .0549801 .3721721 0.15 0.883 -.6750553 .7850155 ebonyi | .6244667 .2307461 2.71 0.007 .171846 1.077087 cross river | .1285754 .3151316 0.41 0.683 -.489572 .7467227 akwa ibom | .6034849 .2663215 2.27 0.024 .0810811 1.125889 abia | .3807716 .2884868 1.32 0.187 -.1851106 .9466537 imo | .795596 .2736021 2.91 0.004 .2589111 1.332281 rivers | .3901126 .3199313 1.22 0.223 -.2374497 1.017675 bayelsa | .2268694 .2062523 1.10 0.272 -.1777054 .6314442 delta | .4423073 .2656391 1.67 0.096 -.078758 .9633726 lagos | .1382112 .4069651 0.34 0.734 -.6600724 .9364948 ogun | .7265004 .2636357 2.76 0.006 .2093649 1.243636 cons | 14.4783 .1604158 90.25 0.000 14.16363 14.79296

Note: Strata with single sampling unit centered at overall mean.

svy: reg agefirstbirthpregTP c.attacknumberTP i.BH c.attacknumberTP#i.BH i.muslim i.urban i.kanuri i.hhheadmale i.literacy i.wealthindex i.edulevel c.eduyears i.edulevelpartner c.eduyearspartner i.largefamily i.polygamoushh i.surveystate Survey: Linear regression

Number of strata=148Number of obs= $9,375$ Number of PSUs=1,892Population size= $9,144,835,358$ Design df=1,744F(53, 1692)=12.96Prob > F=0.0000R-squared=0.0901
Linearized agefirstbirthpregTP Coef. Std. Err. t P> t [95% Conf. Interval]
attacknumberTP .071027 .006938 10.24 0.000 .0574193 .0846346 1.BH 1112492 .126494 -0.88 0.3793593451 .1368466 3H#c.attacknumberTP
1 0699279 .0069386 -10.08 0.00008353680563191 1.muslim 0973278 .0873922 -1.11 0.2662687322 .0740766

1.urban | .0955667 .0632548 1.51 0.131 -.0284964 .2196298 1.kanuri | -.1299689 .1442185 -0.90 0.368 -.4128283 .1528905 1.hhheadmale | -.0782056 .0865481 -0.90 0.366 -.2479547 .0915434 1.literacy | .151714 .0776939 1.95 0.051 -.0006691 .3040971 wealthindex | poorer | .060747 .05595 1.09 0.278 -.0489892 .1704831 middle | -.0071219 .0685636 -0.10 0.917 -.1415974 .1273536 richer | .0532612 .0824339 0.65 0.518 -.1084185 .2149409 richest | .010767 .113259 0.10 0.924 -.2113707 .2329047 1.87 0.061 -.0092684 1.edulevel | .1963236 .104823 .4019156 eduvears | .0174825 .0112269 .0395021 1.56 0.120 -.0045371 1.edulevelpartner | -.1930564 .1015509 -1.90 0.057 -.3922308 .006118 eduyearspartner | .0318046 .009385 3.39 0.001 .0133975 .0502117 1.largefamily | .0303519 .0405891 0.75 0.455 -.0492565 .1099602 1.polygamoushh | -.1620505 .0458664 -3.53 0.000 -.2520094 -.0720917 surveystate | zamfara | .0858908 .1330291 0.65 0.519 -.1750224 .3468041 katsina | -.5840868 .1207941 -4.84 0.000 -.8210034 -.3471702 jigawa | .2658763 .1246078 2.13 0.033 .0214798 .5102728 yobe | -.0821049 .1665512 -0.49 0.622 -.408766 .2445562 borno | -.8917408 .213171 -4.18 0.000 -1.309838 -.4736431 adamawa | .3680567 .139635 2.64 0.008 .0941872 .6419263 gombe | .2724548 .1226303 2.22 0.026 .0319369 .5129728 bauchi | .072955 .124723 0.58 0.559 -.1716674 .3175773 kano | .2036385 .1214449 1.68 0.094 -.0345544 .4418315 kaduna | 0 (omitted) kebbi | .1575467 .1378783 1.14 0.253 -.1128773 .4279708 -2.12 0.034 -.5727169 -.0218389 niger | -.2972779 .1404352 abuja | -.6414893 .2574665 -2.49 0.013 -1.146465 -.1365138 nasarawa | .0675104 .1564192 0.43 0.666 -.2392784 .3742992 plateau | -.6286565 .2015918 -3.12 0.002 -1.024044 -.2332694 0.39 0.700 -.1954055 taraba | .0477431 .1239716 .2908918 benue | .0530447 .1622574 0.33 0.744 -.2651948 .3712841 kogi | -.6367253 .1727088 -3.69 0.000 -.9754634 -.2979871 kwara | .3226968 .1683973 1.92 0.055 -.007585 .6529785 oyo | .5029193 .1618882 3.11 0.002 .1854039 .8204346 osun | .3371306 .1697553 1.99 0.047 .0041854 .6700759 ekiti | .242641 .2130414 1.14 0.255 -.1752024 .6604844 ondo | .0348621 .2134846 0.16 0.870 -.3838506 .4535748 edo | .3004096 .2602866 1.15 0.249 -.210097 .8109162 anambra | .0860519 .2592354 0.33 0.740 -.4223929 .5944968 enugu | -.2526511 .2600984 -0.97 0.332 -.7627886 .2574864 ebonyi | -.0645027 .2070343 -0.31 0.755 -.4705643 .3415589 cross river | .0781527 .2246077 0.35 0.728 -.3623761 .5186815 akwa ibom | -.2286795 .2535716 -0.90 0.367 -.7260158 .2686568

imo .2211599 .2873089 0.77 0.4423423463 .7846662 rivers 3946292 .2624022 -1.50 0.1339092852 .1200268 bayelsa 4284522 .1931851 -2.22 0.0278073510495534 delta 0722554 .2312345 -0.31 0.7555257815 .3812707 lagos .409688 .2699203 1.52 0.1291197135 .9390894 ogun .2558986 .1929527 1.33 0.1851225443 .6343416 	ahia I	6430127	2656633	2 4 2	0.016	1219606	1 164065
imo .2211599 .2873089 0.77 0.442 3423463 .7846662 rivers 3946292 .2624022 -1.50 0.133 9092852 .1200268 bayelsa 4284522 .1931851 -2.22 0.027 807351 0495534 delta 0722554 .2312345 -0.31 0.755 5257815 .3812707 lagos .409688 .2699203 1.52 0.129 1197135 .9390894 ogun .2558986 .1929527 1.33 0.185 1225443 .6343416		.0400121	.2000000	2.72 a 77	0.010	.1210000	
rivers 3946292 .2624022 -1.50 0.1339092852 .1200268 bayelsa 4284522 .1931851 -2.22 0.0278073510495534 delta 0722554 .2312345 -0.31 0.7555257815 .3812707 lagos .409688 .2699203 1.52 0.1291197135 .9390894 ogun .2558986 .1929527 1.33 0.1851225443 .6343416 	imo	.2211599	.2873089	0.77	0.442	3423463	.7846662
bayelsa 4284522 .1931851 -2.22 0.0278073510495534 delta 0722554 .2312345 -0.31 0.7555257815 .3812707 lagos .409688 .2699203 1.52 0.1291197135 .9390894 ogun .2558986 .1929527 1.33 0.1851225443 .6343416 	rivers -	.3946292	.2624022	-1.50	0.133	9092852	.1200268
delta 0722554 .2312345 -0.31 0.7555257815 .3812707 lagos .409688 .2699203 1.52 0.1291197135 .9390894 ogun .2558986 .1929527 1.33 0.1851225443 .6343416 	bayelsa	4284522	.1931851	-2.22	2 0.027	807351	0495534
lagos .409688 .2699203 1.52 0.1291197135 .9390894 ogun .2558986 .1929527 1.33 0.1851225443 .6343416 	delta -	.0722554	.2312345	-0.31	0.755	5257815	.3812707
ogun .2558986 .1929527 1.33 0.1851225443 .6343416 _cons 16.46443 .152316 108.09 0.000 16.16569 16.76317	lagos	.409688	.2699203	1.52	0.129	1197135	.9390894
 cons 16.46443 .152316 108.09 0.000 16.16569 16.76317	ogun	.2558986	.1929527	1.33	0.185	1225443	.6343416
cons 16.46443 .152316 108.09 0.000 16.16569 16.76317							
	_cons	16.46443	.152316	108.09	0.000	16.16569	16.76317

Note: Strata with single sampling unit centered at overall mean.

Subject: Re: Diff in Diff OLS Estimation and Interpretation Posted by Liz-DHS on Fri, 29 May 2020 14:39:30 GMT View Forum Message <> Reply to Message

Dear User, a response from Dr. Tom Pullum: Quote:

I would say much the same thing. The effect of an additional attack in a non-BH area is .061 (or .071). The effect of an additional attack in a BH area is effectively zero. However, in a BH area the coefficient of .268 (or -.111) cannot be ignored. For the first outcome, the effect of BH is equivalent to .268/.061 = 4.4 attacks in a non-BH area. However, and this is important, the coefficient of BH is not statistically significant. For the second outcome, it's harder to interpret--the effect of a BH area is equivalent to -.111/.071 = -1.6 attacks in a non-BH area. But that coefficient of BH also is not significant, so it's not a good idea to try to interpret it.

You have taken the first state in the entire list of states, Sokoto, as the reference state. Apparently the coefficient for Kaduna is so close to that of Sokoto that Stata has in effect grouped Kaduna with Sokoto, by giving it a coefficient of 0.

You might consider restricting to the northern zones of Nigeria, because I believe most of the states have no Boko Haram and no attacks. However, you know more about the context than I do!

Subject: Re: Diff in Diff OLS Estimation and Interpretation Posted by Goethe2014 on Fri, 29 May 2020 15:25:55 GMT View Forum Message <> Reply to Message

Dear Tom,

Thank you very much for the reassuring answer.

Regarding the omitted Kaduna state dummy. Is there anything I can do to change that? Kaduna is part of my BH treatment group (BH=1) while Sokoto is not (BH=0) so if Stata groups them this would work against the overall specification of my treatment groups somehow - I hope this makes sense.

With regard to the northeastern region you mean that instead of comparing the affected states to the non/less-affected states in Nigeria I run an usual OLS regression on the BH affected states only - so make use of the attacknumber as a typical continuous independent variable similar to education years and only analyze the effects of an additional attack on my dependent variables in the conflict region?

Thank you very much in advance. Greetings Caspar